

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

25X1A9A

DRAFT/
23 July 1975

MEMORANDUM FOR: Lieutenant General Brent Scowcroft, USAF
Deputy Assistant to the President for
National Security Affairs

SUBJECT: The NSCIC Working Group

1. I think that I owe you, as the incoming Chairman of the NSCIC Working Group, my thoughts on how the work of this body has developed in the recent past and how its activities and procedures might best be handled in the future.

2. Last March I proposed a tentative work program for the Group which had three basic elements: briefings, informational papers, and action projects.

3. Briefings, on the functioning of the National Intelligence Officers, aspects of intelligence warning, the Mayaguez affair, SALT and MBFR, have been designed to provide the type of background data which would lend support to Working Group efforts. I believe the Group can continue to benefit from having about one briefing per meeting. (Attachment A is a draft agenda for the next meeting which proposes a briefing on the Middle East.)

4. Informational papers, on such subjects as "Consumer Contact Points with Production Elements of the Intelligence Community," and "The DCI's 'Family' of National Intelligence Guidance Documents,"

NSC Declassification/Release Instructions on File

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

have been developed by my staff in response to comments and questions raised during our meetings. (Mr. Ober has these papers.) My staff has also been working on a paper dealing with the difficult and long-standing problem of expressing uncertainty in intelligence estimates. (I am turning to some knowledgeable people in CIA for assistance on this problem; meanwhile, I see some value in having it known in the Community that the subject still engages the interest of the consumers.)

5. We have not, thus far, responded to a request from Admiral Hilton for a "Handbook on the US Intelligence Community," which would show the Community structure, with its organizations, committees, boards, panels, etc., and their membership. Parts of this subject are already addressed in the "Consumer Contact Points" paper, while certain organizational aspects, as you can appreciate, are moving targets these days.

6. Working Group action projects, have so far involved, for example, the members' comments on this year's draft DCI Objectives for the Intelligence Community, Perspectives for Intelligence, and Key Intelligence Questions. I would consider it appropriate in the future for the Working Group to provide the Community with consumer evaluations of important intelligence products, such as selected NIEs, SNIEs, NIAMs, and current intelligence publications--e.g., the NID or NIB and the DIN.

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

7. In my view, the action projects are really what the Working Group is all about. My draft of the Terms of Reference (Attachment B) proposes a committee structure which would, I think, permit the Group to proceed with its work in an orderly way. I believe that, in this context, it is extremely important to maintain the distinction between the work we in the Intelligence Community can do in support of the Group's activities and the work which the members of the Group (and their staffs) should provide themselves. The principle at work here is, to me, quite simple: the members should represent or reflect the views of consumers, not the attitudes and preconceptions of the Community or any of its several parts.

8. I can, of course, provide you as the Working Group Chairman with informational papers and briefings, and I can continue to provide an Executive Secretary for the Group, should this prove necessary. But if there is to be a separate "Consumer Evaluation and Guidance Panel" (by whatever name), I think it should be composed of and staffed by users rather than intelligence officers. (And I have incorporated that concept in the draft Terms of Reference.)

9. Perhaps this matter could be clarified at the next meeting. And perhaps the discussion of the Terms of Reference should deal in detail with such questions as the composition of the membership and the frequency of the meetings of the Working Group subcommittees.

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

10. Another issue pertinent to the Terms of Reference is whether the NSCIC Working Group should, as Mr. Morell of the Treasury Department advocates, "make recommendations for improvements in intelligence structure and organization." Based on his reading of the interest of the Rockefeller and Murphy Commissions and the Senate Select Committee in organizational matters, Mr. Morell would have us go beyond the charter provided by NSCID No. 1 (February 1972) which says that NSCIC

"will give direction and guidance on national substantive intelligence needs and provide for a continuing evaluation of intelligence products from the viewpoint of the intelligence consumer."

11. I think Mr. Morell's proposal would in effect force the Group to engage in unwise and unauthorized activities, and therefore I oppose it. It is one thing for customers to comment to a super-market chain about the quality of meat and produce, but quite another for them to issue specific guidelines on feeding poultry and fertilizing vegetables. There probably will be discussion of this issue, however, and altogether some 30-40 minutes might be needed to cover this and other issues associated with the Terms of Reference (agenda item c).

~~SECRET~~

12. Your pressing schedule probably would make it difficult for you to review the files on previous Working Group activities. But you might, in addition to considering the proposed agenda and Terms of Reference, wish to look over the draft minutes of the last meeting (Attachment C) to gain some idea of the "tone" of the discussions.

Samuel V. Wilson
Lieutenant General, USA
Deputy to the DCI for the
Intelligence Community

Attachments:

Draft agenda for next NSCIC Working Group meeting
Draft Terms of Reference for NSCIC Working Group
Draft Minutes of 2 July Working Group meeting

D
R
A
F
T

Attachment A

MEMORANDUM FOR: NSCIC Working Group Members
SUBJECT: Agenda for August Meeting

1. As your new Chairman, I propose to hold the next meeting on ____ August at _____ hours in the White House Situation Room.

2. I expect the meeting to last about 90-100 minutes, and to cover the following items:

- a. Approval of Minutes of 2 July meeting
- b. Arab-Israeli Problem:

NIO/ME Briefing

Discussion of NIAM on Arab-Israeli Hostilities, Memorandum to Holders of SNIE on "Next Steps in Middle East," OPR research paper on "Arab World in the 1980s," and Alert Memo on Egypt.

- c. Ratification of NSCIC Working Group Terms of Reference and formation of Working Group Subcommittees.
- d. Proposals for new business and closing remarks by the Chairman.

25X1A9A

3. For this meeting, please inform
of the Intelligence Community Staff of the names
of proposed attendees.

STAT

Brent L. Scowcroft
Lieutenant General, USAF
Chairman, NSCIC Working Group

Attachment B

DRAFT TERMS OF REFERENCE
OF
THE NATIONAL SECURITY COUNCIL INTELLIGENCE COMMITTEE
WORKING GROUP

(Effective _____ 1975)

1. Establishment of a National Security Council Intelligence Committee was directed by the President in his memorandum of 5 November 1971, "Organization and Management of the U.S. Foreign Intelligence Community," which was reflected in the revised National Security Council Intelligence Directive No. 1, "Basic Duties and Responsibilities," effective 17 February 1972. NSCID No. 1 provides that the NSCIC is to "give direction and guidance on national substantive intelligence needs and provide for a continuing evaluation of intelligence products from the viewpoint of the intelligence consumer."

2. Authority

The NSCIC Working Group was established pursuant to discussion at the initial NSCIC meeting of 3 December 1971 and was reconstituted with a consumer orientation as a result of NSCIC action at its August 1974 meeting.

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

3. Mission

The NSCIC Working Group will support the NSCIC and facilitate NSCIC actions to give direction and guidance on national substantive needs for intelligence and provide for a continuing evaluation of intelligence products from the viewpoint of the intelligence consumer.

4. Organization and Membership

a. the NSCIC Working Group shall consist of one representative of each NSCIC member, under a Chairman designated by the NSCIC. The Chairman of the Working Group will also appoint an Executive Secretary.

b. Except for the Deputy to the DCI for the Intelligence Community, who is the representative of the Director of Central Intelligence, members of the Working Group will be users of intelligence, not intelligence officers.

c. The representative of the DCI will establish, and chair, an Intelligence Panel, including representatives from the major intelligence production organizations, to provide intelligence support to the efforts of the Working Group.

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

d. The Chairman of the Working Group will organize a Consumer Evaluation and Guidance Panel to conduct appraisals of intelligence papers disseminated to national level users and prepare recommendations for the Community's family of intelligence guidance documents.

e. Intelligence users from departments and agencies not represented on the NSCIC may be invited by the Working Group to attend its meetings when appropriate.

5. Functions

The NSCIC Working Group will:

a. Present action recommendations to the NSCIC in furtherance of the mission of the NSCIC.

b. Conduct such studies, surveys, reviews, evaluations and inquiries as may be directed by the NSCIC in execution of its mission.

c. Initiate for NSCIC approval such inter-agency studies, surveys, reviews, evaluations and inquiries as the Working Group considers are pertinent to the furtherance of the program of the NSCIC.

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

6. Method of Operation

a. Meetings of the Working Group will be on the call of the Chairman. Any member desiring that the Working Group be convened will so advise the Chairman.

b. Action projects for Working Group sponsorship can be proposed by any member of the Group.

c. Responsibility for the conduct of studies and preparation of reports undertaken under Working Group sponsorship will be assigned by the Chairman as agreed among the members.

d. For the preparation of studies and reports, the Working Group can establish inter-agency task groups or assign responsibility to a single organization as determined on the basis of the nature of the problem.

e. All studies and reports prepared under auspices of the Working Group will be submitted to the Working Group for its consideration prior to being given any dissemination by the task group or other person's charged with preparation of the documents.

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

f. Working Group decisions will be reached by consensus among the members, but in the event full agreement is not attained, the Chairman, in forwarding the results of Working Group action to the NSCIC, will advise the NSCIC of the dissent or differing opinion of any member who so requests.

g. Studies and reviews accomplished under Working Group auspices for background and information use which do not contain action recommendations and which the Working Group considers do not require referral to the NSCIC may be disseminated by the Working Group Chairman directly to such organizations and agencies as the Working Group considers would find them useful.

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

IC 75-2449
21 July 1975

MEMORANDUM FOR: Members, NSCIC Working Group

SUBJECT: Transmittal of Documents

1. Attached are draft minutes of the 2 July meeting. Please convey your corrections to me at your convenience.
2. Attached also is a copy of the Memorandum to Holders of SNIE 30-1-75, "Next Steps in the Middle East." This should be considered part of the background package which includes the NIAM on Arab-Israeli Hostilities and the CIA/Office of Political Research paper on the Arab World in the 80s. The NIO for the Middle East will brief the Working Group on these papers and related intelligence issues and hopes to receive your comments on these matters prior to or at the next meeting of the Working Group.
3. The time and precise agenda for the next Working Group meeting will be announced shortly.

25X1A9A

Executive Secretary
NSCIC Working Group

Attachments:
Minutes
SNIE 30-1-75

25X1

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

~~SECRET~~

Distribution:

Original - PRD Subject

1 - George S. Vest & Leslie H. Brown

1 - Robert F. Ellsworth

1 - William N. Morell, Jr.

1 - Lt. Gen. John H. Elder, Jr.

1 - Richard Ober

1 - VADM E. F. Rectanus

1 - Anthony Cordesman

1 - Gen. Wilson

1 - C/PRD (& PRD Chrono)

~~1~~ - IC Registry

1 - AB Subject

1 - WMH Chrono

25X1A9A DCI/IC/PRD/ [] (21 July 75)

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

NATIONAL SECURITY COUNCIL INTELLIGENCE COMMITTEE WORKING GROUP

Draft Minutes of the Fourteenth Meeting
1430 Hours, 2 July 1975
White House Situation Room

Chairman: Lt. Gen. Samuel V. Wilson, D/DCI/IC

Members present: Mr. Charles Flowerree, Department of State
(representing Mr. George S. Vest, Director,
Bureau of Politico-Military Affairs)
Mr. Robert Ellsworth, Assistant Secretary of
Defense (International Security Affairs)
Mr. William N. Morell, Special Assistant to the
Secretary of the Treasury for National
Security
RADM Robert P. Hilton, JCS (representing Lt. Gen.
John H. Elder, J-5, Plans and Policy)
Mr. Richard Ober, NSC Staff, Director for
International Coordination

Briefers: DIA/Directorate for Collection
25X1A9A IC Staff

Others present: VADM E. F. Rectanus, with Mr. Ellsworth
RADM Donald Harvey, with RADM Hilton
Captain Gerald N. Dyer, with RADM Hilton

25X1

Agenda Item 1: Approval of Minutes and Organizational Notice

1. The revised draft minutes of the 20 May meeting were approved.
 2. General Wilson announced that effective prior to the next meeting Lt. Gen. Brent Scowcroft would become the new Chairman.
- General Wilson said he welcomed this as a necessary step in making the Working Group truly the voice of the consumer.

25X1

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

Agenda Item 2: MBFR Briefing

25X1 3. [] of the Directorate of Collections in DIA gave a presentation on Intelligence Issues in Mutual and Balanced Force Reduction considerations. This briefing was in response to a recommendation by Ambassador Ellsworth, and was given at the TS level mainly in order to cover discussion of specific collection systems. Most of the briefing and attendant discussion was at a lower level of classification.

4. Ambassador Ellsworth made several points in reaction to the briefing, e.g.:

--Apart from the Soviet and East European authorities who would object to Western observers seeking to verify an MBFR agreement, the West Germans have indicated that they would not welcome Russian observers on their territory for the same purpose.

--Given the uncertainties exposed in this briefing, the problem of monitoring the Warsaw Pact forces in the NATO Guidelines Area (NGA) is pressing even in the absence of an MBFR agreement.

25X1 5. Admiral Rectanus also made a number of observations, and raised the question of whether the Pact could use qualitative improvements in the capabilities of the forces to offset quantitative changes effected under an MBFR agreement. []

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

25X1

Agenda Item 3: Status Report

8. The Chairman reported that the Objectives paper, which consisted of both substantive objectives and milestones in resource management--the latter portion at least partly responsive to Admiral Hilton's concerns--had been approved by USIB and would be submitted to IRAC. Working Group members would have the opportunity to comment again on the paper, but this time their comments should go directly to NSCIC.

9. The Chairman reported that the paper on specific statement of uncertainties was being worked on in pieces. One of these, a paper on expressing uncertainties in technical judgments was now being staffed through GMAIC. Ambassador Ellsworth and Mr. Morell both

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

made clear that such a paper, while useful, would answer only a part of their requirements on this subject.

10. Among other business the Chairman reported that as a followup to the Mayaguez post-mortem he had arranged for meetings involving representatives of watch officers and operations centers to discuss ways of improving the handling of critical intelligence. The guide to community production and consumer contact points had been revised per the recommendations of the Working Group and would be published shortly. A draft on the staffing and distribution of the Family of National Intelligence Guidance Documents, circulated to the members, would be revised for formal dissemination later. A followup paper on the Skylink system, prepared at the request of Treasury, had been distributed.

Agenda Item 4: TRs for NSCIC Working Group

11. Mr. Morell noted that the assumptions about organization, arrangements, systems, and the like in the draft TRs are now suspect. Whatever is decided through the Rockefeller and Murphy Reports about NSCIC will inevitably "rub" on us. Therefore we are "starting on the wrong end."

12. Mr. Ober observed, however, that we can do much of the drafting prior to the next meeting, and save final decisions until then. He wanted to get comments from the members as soon as possible. Ambassador Ellsworth called attention to Mr. Ober's paper on the work program for (sub)committee(s) of the NSCIC Working Group and proposed that the Ober paper be factored in to the revised TRs.

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

13. With regard to the membership of the committee, General Wilson expressed the desire that Mr. Ober chair it. Mr. Ober said that he hoped all nominees for the committee would be users of intelligence, rather than producers.

Agenda Item 5: Intelligence Issues in Warning

14. This item, originally planned as item 5, was discussed immediately after the MBFR briefing, per decision of the Chairman.

25X1A9A 15. [] of the IC Staff discussed the distinction that separates warning from estimates or forecasts: warning implies decisions to take actions. That is, the convergence and summation of the indicators lead to an analysis that in turn leads to a decision to take an action.

25X1A9A The action generates indicators to an opponent, and an action-reaction cycle takes place. [] provided illustrations of the complexity of this cycle from the Japanese decision process leading to Pearl Harbor and the Middle East War of October 1973. He then briefly reviewed efforts in the Community to use improved communication techniques to converge critical information. Beyond that, he stressed the need for the Community to make warning statements in probabilistic terms, and the importance for the consumer to accept probabilistic warning estimates because they concern the type of decision (from drastic down to none) he is attempting to make.

16. There were several minutes of general discussion on this briefing. The Chairman said he realized that this briefing was "tutorial" in nature. The main point is there is a need to develop a common

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

language between producers and consumers and this type of approach is one useful step toward that end. There was general agreement with the Chairman's comments.

Next Meeting

17. There was agreement that the new Chairman would schedule the next meeting for August. Ambassador Ellsworth expressed, on behalf of the other members, congratulations to General Wilson for his efforts as Chairman to get things moving.

25X1A9A

Executive Secretary
NSCIC Working Group

Approved For Release 2004/10/08 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100180006-0

~~SECRET~~

Distribution:

Original - PRD Subject

25X1 1 - [REDACTED]
1 - Robert F. Ellsworth
1 - William N. Morell, Jr.
1 - Lt. Gen. John H. Elder, Jr.
1 - Richard Ober
1 - VADM E. F. Rectanus
25X1 1 - [REDACTED]
1 - Lt. Gen. Brent Scowcroft
1 - Edward Proctor
25X1 1 - [REDACTED]
1 - Maj. Gen. Herbert E. Wolff
1 - Lt. Gen. Eugene F. Tighe, Jr.
1 - George Carver
1 - Maj. Gen. Jack E. Thomas
1 - General Wilson
1 - C/PRD (& PRD Chrono)
✓ 1 - IC Registry
1 - AB Subject
25X1A9A 1 - WMH Chrono

DCI/IC/PRD/ [REDACTED] (18 July 75)